

of abuse even after Bèze's death, while the Protestant party defended him as the victim of malicious misinterpretation on the part of his foes. Even from the standpoint of the twentieth century, the sources do not sustain the allegation that Bèze's friendship for Audebert amounted to a homosexual liaison. His life is more an emblem of the web of insult and countercharge that characterized the first century of the Reformation.

BIBLIOGRAPHY. Ferdinand Karsch-Haack, "Quellenmaterial zur Beurteilung angeblicher und wirklicher Uranier. 1. Theodor Beza, der Reformator," *Jahrbuch für sexuelle Zwischenstufen*, 4 (1902), 291-349; Alexandre Machard, "Recherches sur la querelle des 'Juvenilia,'" in *Les Juvenilia de Théodore de Bèze*, Paris: Isidore Liseux, 1879; Anne Lake Prescott, "English Writers and Beza's Latin Epigrams: The Uses and Abuses of Poetry," *Studies in the Renaissance*, 21 (1974), 83-117.

Warren Johansson

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Bibliographical control of published material on homosexuality encounters several problems. First, there is the inherent vastness of the subject itself: to paraphrase Goethe, the history of homosexual behavior is virtually coterminous with that of the human race. Accordingly, serious study must be cross-cultural, interdisciplinary, and transhistorical. Secondly, the taboo in which the theme has been enveloped means that until recently subject bibliographies often had no entry for it, or when they did would relegate it to some negative umbrella category, such as "perversion" or "sexual deviation." Even today the indexes and tables of contents of books often fail to mention the topic. Finally, the difficulty of establishing gay studies courses and programs in universities—blocked as they have been by tradition, inertia, and simple prejudice—has starved the field of money, personnel, and prestige. Standing against these hindrances

is the devotion of countless individual gay and lesbian scholars, who have not only amassed a vast amount of primary data, but sought to display them in works of reference.

*Origins.* Greek literature rejoices in extensive discussions of homosexuality, or to be more accurate of *paiderasteia*. [For modern listings of this accumulated heritage, see Félix Buffière, *Eros adolescent: la pédérastie dans la Grèce antique* (Paris, 1980), and Claude Courouve, *Tableau synoptique de références à l'amour masculin: auteurs grecs et latins* (Paris, 1986).] The Greeks themselves had no discipline of bibliography proper; however, for an anthology of passages on homosexuality, see Athenaeus (fl. ca. A.D. 200), *Deipnosophists*, Book 13.

The tradition of erudition that emerged in early modern Europe after the invention of printing saw some hesitant assemblage of references to homosexual behavior. These data are found scattered in Latin tomes in the fields of theology, law, medicine, and classical studies. In the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries some of this information was digested for more popular consumption in admittedly meager encyclopedia articles in the vernacular. It was these sources that had to be patiently combed by such pioneers of homosexual scholarship as Heinrich Hoessli and Karl Heinrich Ulrichs, John Addington Symonds, and Havelock Ellis.

The emergence of systematic bibliographical control had to await the birth of the first homosexual emancipation movement in Berlin in 1897. This movement firmly held that progress toward homosexual rights must go hand in hand with intellectual enlightenment. Accordingly, each year's production was noted in the annual volumes of the *Jahrbuch für sexuelle Zwischenstufen* (1899-1923); by the end of the first ten years of monitoring over 1000 new titles had been recorded. Although surveys were made of earlier literature, up to the time of the extinction of the movement by National Socialism in

1933, no attempt had been made to organize this material into a single comprehensive bibliography of homosexual studies. Nonetheless, much valuable material was noted in the vast work of Magnus Hirschfeld, *Die Homosexualität des Mannes und des Weibes* (Berlin, 1914).

*The American Phase and Its Influence.* The nascent American homophile movement, which began about 1950, took cognizance of the need for a comprehensive bibliography. Donald Webster Cory's *The Homosexual in America* (New York, 1951), a landmark of the early movement, had as appendices lists of both non-fiction and fiction on the subject. By the late 1950s small-scale efforts toward this end had begun to coalesce in Los Angeles and the San Francisco Bay area, two of the movement's strongest centers. After many delays, the Los Angeles endeavors resulted in the most ambitious project attempted up to that point: Vern Bullough et al., *Annotated Bibliography of Homosexuality* (2 vols., New York, 1976), which was prepared in the Los Angeles offices of ONE, Inc. This work provides about 13,000 entries arranged in twenty broad subject categories. Some notion of the enormity of the whole subject is conveyed by the fact that, even at that date, the number of entries could probably have been doubled. Unlike most of the other American bibliographies, this work is international and multilingual in scope; unfortunately the set is marred by thousands of small errors and lacunae, especially in foreign-language items. The title notwithstanding, annotations are very few, and uncertain in their critical stance. Full subject indexes, which would have served to offset some of these shortcomings are lacking; instead each volume has its own author indexes. The shortcomings of this major work, undertaken largely by volunteer staff working under movement auspices, illustrate the problems that have, as often as not, been made inevitable by the social neglect and obloquy in which the subject has been enveloped. Unfortunately,

plans for a completely revised edition of the ONE bibliography have had to be shelved, at least for the present.

In San Francisco in the 1960s William Parker began gathering material for a one-person effort. His first attempt was *Homosexuality: Selected Abstracts and Bibliography* (San Francisco, 1966); this publication, and a number of other earlier lists, are now most easily accessible in the Arno Press reprint: *A Gay Bibliography: Eight Bibliographies on Lesbianism and Male Homosexuality* (New York, 1975). Parker's more definitive work is *Homosexuality: A Selected Bibliography of over 3,000 Items* (Metuchen, NJ, 1971), followed by two supplements (published in 1977 and 1985), which carry coverage up through 1982. These volumes arrange the material (English-language only) by types of publication; there are helpful subject indices. Although some note is taken of films, television programs and audiovisual materials, the coverage of print items is almost entirely restricted to nonfiction.

Parker's two supplements cover six- and seven-year periods respectively, but there is no current annual bibliography. *Gay Books Bulletin* (later *The Cabirion*), issued by the Scholarship Committee of the New York Chapter of the Gay Academic Union (1979-85), concentrated on in-depth reviews, but ceased after twelve issues. The best way of monitoring current production is through the "Relevant" section of the scholarly Dutch bimonthly *Homologie* (Amsterdam, 1978- ).

In San Francisco the lesbian monthly *The Ladder*, published by the Daughters of Bilitis organization, included notices of books from its inception in 1956 (the full set was reissued with a new index in New York in 1975). Eventually these notices were coordinated on a monthly basis by Gene Damon (Barbara Grier), whose later columns have been recently collected in a handy, indexed volume: *Lesbiana: Book Reviews from the Ladder, 1966-1972* (Reno, 1976). Utilizing input from Marion Zimmer Bradley and others,

Damon and Lee Stuart produced the first edition of *The Lesbian in Literature: A Bibliography* (San Francisco, 1967). This work subsequently appeared in an expanded, third edition: Barbara Grier, *The Lesbian in Literature* (Tallahassee, 1981), with about 3100 items, including some nonfiction. The entries are coded by an unusual rating system, which correlates both relevance and quality.

The complement to Grier in the male sphere is Ian Young, *The Male Homosexual in Literature: A Bibliography* (Metuchen, NJ, 1982), with 4282 items, interpretive essays by several hands, and title index. While there are no annotations, Young sweeps the field: fiction, poetry, drama, and autobiography. Like Grier, the volume is limited to works written in English and translations of foreign works.

Apart from the general bibliographies just discussed, which claim to cover at least the whole-English language production in their chosen domains, there are also a number of works defined by country of production. William Crawford (ed.), *Homosexuality in Canada: A Bibliography* (Toronto, 1984), contains a good deal of material, in French as well as English, that has been overlooked elsewhere. Manfred Herzer, *Bibliographie zur Homosexualität . . .* (Berlin, 1982) is an exemplary compilation of nonfiction items published in German from 1466 to 1975. A similar work, annotated, is Giovanni Dall'Orto, *Leggere omosessuale* (Turin, 1984), which covers Italian publications from 1800 to 1983. Still to be covered is the rich Italian material before 1800. Claude Courouve's work on French bibliography has been privately published.

Almost from the beginning homosexual organizations have created their own periodicals to supplement the mainstream journals which tend to scant, or even exclude altogether research on sexual variation. A detailed roster of no less than 1924 publications existing (or believed to exist) in the 1980s is Robert

Malinowsky, *International Directory of Gay and Lesbian Periodicals* (Phoenix, 1987). By definition, this work does not include older journals that had ceased (309 of these are listed in Bullough, et al., cited above), nor does it provide, for obvious reasons, a listing of the contents of these publications. Gay and lesbian journals are covered only sporadically in current bibliographies, and even copies of the less familiar newspapers are hard to find once they leave the stands; here the gay and lesbian archives are doing an essential job of preservation, since public and university libraries usually do not preserve these materials.

A summation of bibliographical work appears in Wayne R. Dynes, *Homosexuality: A Research Guide* (New York, 1987). In addition to the bibliography section proper, each of the approximately 170 subject groups contains an introduction outlining the strengths and problems of the topic in its current state of development (or lack of development). This volume is conceived as interdisciplinary, cross-cultural, and transhistorical, and may be consulted for a sense of the complexity of the overarching field. In some respects it is the complement to the present *Encyclopedia of Homosexuality*, where space for citations is necessarily limited.

*Electronic Retrieval.* In due course the bibliographical situation will be transformed by electronic systems of retrieval of material from data-base sources. For financial reasons, this shift began first in the natural and biological sciences. An early exemplar is the MEDLARS medical database, which traces its origins to 1964. A facility of considerable use to the study of homosexual behavior is the PsychLIT Database, which offers citations and summaries in psychology and related disciplines published from January 1981 on. It is compiled from material published in *Psychology Abstracts* and the PsychINFO Database. PsychLIT covers about 1400 journals in 29 languages from approximately 54 countries. The Lexis system,

available mainly in law libraries, goes back to the early 1970s. Geared mainly to the practice of law in North America, *Lexis* also offers access to British and French libraries. As these examples show, the time frame of such enterprises tends to restrict the items collected to recent years, so that exclusive use of such sources narrows the focus of material at the researcher's disposal by date of origin of the material.

Large public and university libraries are beginning to record their acquisitions—though not usually extending to older holdings—in on-line systems, which are gradually being “hooked up” into larger systems. One such computerized catalogue lists the recent acquisitions of 25 major American research libraries, with terminals and print-out facilities in all of them. These retrieval systems are commonly linked to printers, so that users can with minimal effort obtain a permanent record of what they have found. In using all these instruments, it must be remembered that they are only as good as what has been entered in them. Classifiers may lack sophistication, so that entries under “Georgian” may mix indiscriminately the American state, the Soviet republic, the Caucasian language, and English architecture. Also, books and periodical articles tend to live in two different universes as far as on-line systems go. For a number of reasons (including the inherent convenience of the book format), conventional, hard-copy materials will probably continue to be used for a long time to come. Of course, the two modes are not incompatible, and the ideal situation is probably that of simultaneous access to most collections of material through both channels.

Whatever systems may be used, the compilers must face the problem of the enormous proliferation of material. In 1910, say, a one-page item would be worth noting, while by 1980 the output has increased so markedly that selectivity is imperative. Today no one would aspire to

collect every piece of writing with some relevance to homosexuality in any given year: too much would simply be redundant. Like all else in human affairs, the problems are in part a function of the time matrix. Yet when all is said and done, our knowledge of homosexuality is increasing. Masses of material that in former decades would have been ignored are being recorded and classified by state-of-the-art techniques.

*See also Libraries and Archives.*

BIBLIOGRAPHY. Wayne R. Dynes, *Homosexuality: A Research Guide*, New York: Garland Publishing, 1987.

### BILITIS

The name Bilitis is one of the Hellenic forms of Ba'alat, the female counterpart of Baal in Northwest Semitic mythology. In the writings of Philo of Byblos, Baaltis is equated with Dione, one of the three daughters of Uranos and consorts of Kronos, who receives the city of Byblos as her domain. The significance of Bilitis for lesbianism stems not from antiquity proper, but from the work of Pierre Louÿs, *Les Chansons de Bilitis, traduites du grec*, first published in 1894, although clandestine editions with the erotically explicit lesbian passages appeared only after the author's death, with the title *Les Chansons de Bilitis inédites* (1929), and as *Les Chansons secrètes de Bilitis* (1931). Louÿs originally offered the collection of texts to the world as translations from a classical source; it made the author's reputation in France and was never surpassed by his later writing. The heroine of the work is described as “born at the beginning of the sixth century before our era, in a mountainous village located on the banks of the Melas, in the eastern part of Pamphylia. . . . She was the daughter of a Greek and a Phoenician woman.” Leaving her homeland, she settled in Mytilene on the isle of Lesbos, “then the center of the world,” which “had as its capital a city